



GREATER FARALLONES & CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARIES
JOINT ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Friday, April 21, 2023

9:00AM – 4:15PM

The Marine Mammal Center and online via Google Meet

MEETING HIGHLIGHTS

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS), Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS), or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

To view slides from any presentation referenced in this document, please email jordan.gorostiza@noaa.gov.

CBNMS Advisory Council Business

CBNMS Advisory Council (CBNMSAC) Chair Kai Martin welcomed all to the meeting and called roll for the council. See Appendix II for CBNMS AC attendance record for this meeting.

The council then welcomed new member Christopher Ohanian who will serve as one of two Fishing Seat members. Christopher comes to the council from Sonoma County Regional Parks, Spud Point Marina. Christopher noted that he is excited to help represent the fishing community in this seat.

The council then approved the draft meeting highlights from the February 2023 council meeting. Community-at-Large Sonoma County member Steve Tubbs motioned to approve the highlights and Research member Jeff Dorman seconded.

CBNMS AC MOTION: Approve February Meeting Highlights

Vote: 5 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

A copy of the meeting highlights is available upon request to jordan.gorostiza@noaa.gov, and will be posted online at <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/documents.html>.

A new council executive committee was elected by majority vote of members. The executive committee consists of the council chair and vice chair. Jeff Dorman was voted in as council chair. Steve Tubbs was voted in as council vice chair. The terms for these positions are two years each and terms are set to begin at the next council meeting in July.

Council Coordinator Jordan Gorostiza informed the council that recruitment is currently underway to fill six open seats on the council including for two research seats whose terms are set to expire in November 2023.

Jeff Dorman inquired about how the sanctuary is getting the word out about open council seats. Jordan replied that sanctuary staff send out announcements to local media, local organizations whose staff may be interested in serving on the councils (e.g., local environmental groups, fishing groups, agencies, and education institutions). Jordan mentioned that cold-emailing did not result in many applicants during the last recruitment period, and that focusing on relationship building with individual contacts within organizations is likely to be more fruitful. Jordan mentioned that he would share his contact list with the council so that they could add to it.

CBNMS Advisory Council Member and Alternate Reports

Council members and alternates shared reports from their constituencies.

Community-at-Large Sonoma County member Steve Tubbs noted that he has been sharing sanctuary posts on social media and leading hikes at Point Reyes.

Conservation member Scott Artis announced that he has started a new role as Executive Director of the Golden State Salmon Association where he has been busy onboarding and working with legislators and stakeholders regarding the recent salmon fishery closure and salmon restoration efforts.

Chair and Maritime Activities member Kai Martin mentioned the recent addition of Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary into the voluntary vessel speed reduction (VSR) program. Kai also mentioned that slowing vessel speeds is good for whales and is more fuel efficient, however slow steaming means that vessel auxiliaries are burning longer which could potentially result in higher emissions. Superintendent Brown made note of this and posited that the sanctuary should look into this more.

Research member Jeff Dorman overviewed upcoming Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies research cruises. He also noted that there are strong indicators for an upcoming El Nino climate pattern.

Research member Chrissy Piotrowski highlighted that she is currently working hard to digitize historical marine data from specimens records and make them available for online use. She also noted that an ONMS 50th anniversary exhibit was still showing at the California Academy of Sciences. Finally, she announced a potential collaboration with the Oakland Museum of California on marine invertebrates.

National Marine Fisheries Service member Kynan Barrios mentioned that the Office of Law Enforcement was busy training new team members. He also overviewed an active investigation regarding a video of an individual jumping from Pier 39 in San Francisco and disturbing sea lions.

GFNMS Advisory Council Arrive and Roll Call

GFNMS Advisory Council (GFNMS AC) Chair Abby Mohan welcomed all to the meeting and called roll for the council.

See Appendix I for GFNMS AC attendance record for this meeting.

Abby mentioned that one addition to the agenda was a potential action item regarding a letter of support from both councils on the Notice of Intent to initiate designation of the Pacific Remote Islands as a national marine sanctuary.

GFNMS and CBNMS Superintendent's Report

Maria Brown, Superintendent of GFNMS and CBNMS, provided updates on GFNMS and CBNMS Operations, Research, Education/Outreach, and Resource Protection program activities since the last council meeting in February.

Highlights included 1) an updated GFNMS/CBNMS management plan review schedule; the sanctuaries expect to officially kick off the management plan review process in Summer 2024, 2) the cancellation due to weather of scheduled remotely operated vehicle (ROV) dives within the sanctuaries on the NOAA ship *Okeanos Explorer*, 3) details on upcoming ACCESS cruises in early May, and 4) upcoming start to the voluntary Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) season.

Superintendent Brown also overviewed recent sanctuary news including 1) significant funding from NOAA going towards projects in Northern California that will benefit the sanctuaries such as salmon restoration efforts and \$4.9 million recommended to the Greater Farallones Association to restore bull kelp forest habitat within GFNMS and 2) a petition from the Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility (PEER) and The Ocean Foundation to the Secretary of Commerce and NOAA Administrator titled, "[Petition for Rulemaking Governing Vessel Speed and Navigation Practices Required to Prevent Collisions with Whales.](#)"

Superintendent Brown also highlighted that one vessel incident had occurred since the last council meeting.

Superintendent Brown responded to a question regarding the purpose of the topic briefings by informing the council that the briefings, with the inclusion of the councils' recommendations, will eventually serve as the scoping document for the upcoming management plan review.

Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo member Bart Selby informed Superintendent Brown that Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory had been testing drone technology within the sanctuary without a permit. Sanctuary staff indicated that they were not aware of this, and would investigate the matter further.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Lisa Wooninck, Superintendent of Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS), provided a brief report on recent and upcoming events at the sanctuary.

Highlights included 1) an overview of research cruises to Sur Ridge, 2) planning efforts for an ROV cruise to survey deep sea coral in southern region of MBNMS in Fall 2023, 3) MBNMS inclusion in the voluntary VSR program, and 5) highlights from an MBNMS staff retreat.

A council member inquired if Elkhorn Slough was included within the boundaries of MBNMS, and Superintendent Wooninck confirmed that portions of the slough were part of the sanctuary.

Public Comment

Eileen Boken, Coalition for San Francisco Neighborhoods: Comment pertained to GFNMS Management Plan Review and potential expansion to include non-contiguous area of waters off San Francisco's Ocean Beach.

Ginger Souders-Mason, Pesticide Free Zone: Comment expressed concern about rodenticide drop on Southeast Farallon Island.

Dan Howard: Comment urged the sanctuaries to continue engagement with the Pacific Fisheries Management Council regarding Non-trawl Rockfish Conservation Areas within CBNMS.

Tom Lambert, Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation: Comment highlighted the Foundation's mission to provide funding for CBNMS research and education, and recently secured funding for hypoxia monitoring within the sanctuary.

George Clyde, Citizen of Marin County: Comment overviewed management of salmon fisheries that led to the current commercial and recreational fisheries closures, and urged the councils to express concern over the decline of the salmon population.

Action item: GFNMS AC and CBNMS AC Letter of Support for Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for the Pacific Remote Islands

The councils discussed and provided edits to a draft letter of support for the Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for the Pacific Remote Islands prepared by GFNMS AC Chair Abby Mohan.

A council member inquired what sanctuary designation would provide this area. Superintendent Brown responded that sanctuary status would provide 1) a comprehensive management plan for the area, 2) the establishment of a sanctuary advisory council, 3) the enforcement of regulations, and 4) response to emergency incidents.

Commercial Fishing alternate Richard Ogg asked Superintendent Brown how offshore wind energy development would intersect with this designation. Superintendent Brown responded that under the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management's (BOEM) current regulations, they cannot place offshore wind development within sanctuaries. If BOEM were to change this regulation to allow for development within sanctuaries, sanctuary regulations would then apply.

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service member Matthew Brown mentioned that perhaps the greatest value of sanctuary designation of this remote area of the Pacific Ocean is that it would provide a strong voice in telling the story of the area and communicating its importance. He went on to

mention that the sanctuary system has done such a great job in communicating and telling the story about these often far-off places.

Education member Bibit Traut inquired about protections for the deep seafloor, in particular for protecting coral reefs. Superintendent Brown noted that those types of specific protections are not within the National Marine Sanctuaries Act. Those types of site-specific regulations would come through the public comment and scoping processes.

Following discussion, both councils made suggested edits to the draft letter of support and voted to send the letter to Superintendent Brown and request she submit it via Regulations.gov.

CBNMSAC member Steve Tubbs motioned to approve the letter for the CBNMS Advisory Council. Research member Jeff Dorman seconded.

CBNMS AC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for the Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for the Pacific Remote Islands

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

For the GFNMS Advisory Council, Conservation member Kathi George motions to approve the letter. National Park Service member Craig Kenkel seconded.

GFNMS AC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for the Proposed Designation of a National Marine Sanctuary for the Pacific Remote Islands

Vote: 12 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

Action item: Fish/White Sharks

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on Fish highlighting White Shark work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan.

Following the presentations, the councils engaged in a discussion with sanctuary staff.

Richard Ogg inquired about species shifts due to changing temperatures and if that information was included in the condition report analysis. GFNMS/CBNMS Research Coordinator Danielle Lipski responded that species that are sensitive to these types of environmental shifts are captured.

GFNMS AC Chair Abby Mohan asked why salmon were not looked at as an indicator species. Dani mentioned that the condition report was not looking at specific fisheries, but at species who could serve as an indicator for the health of the sanctuary. Dani also highlighted the sanctuaries' concern about the species.

Community-at-Large Marin County alternate Richard James mentioned the need for increased resource protection signage along Tomales Bay, but noted that county parks do not want signage interfering with views of the bay.

Conservation member Francesca Koe asked about how hatchery practices impact fish species within the sanctuary. Commercial Fishing member Sarah Bates overviewed a number of hatchery practices including timing of water releases, measures to reduce risk of kill-off due to low water flow or high water temperature.

Francesca also asked if there was an effort to work with the State of California during its Marine Protected Area Decadal Review which aims to evaluate progress toward reaching the goals of the California Marine Life Protection Act. Superintendent Brown stated that the sanctuaries are engaged in discussion with the State to identify how the GFNMS/CBNMS management plan review and the State decadal review could complement one another.

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. For the CBNMS Advisory Council, Steve Tubbs motioned to support the staff recommendations with Advisory Council edits. Jeff Dorman seconded.

CBNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations for Fish/White Sharks

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/actions.html>.

For the GFNMS Advisory Council, Kathi George motioned to support the staff recommendations. Craig Kenkel seconded.

GFNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations for Fish/White Sharks

Vote: 12 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_actions.html.

Action item: Bolinas Lagoon

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014 regarding Bolinas Lagoon. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan. Note that this presentation was delivered only to the GFNMS Advisory Council.

Following the presentations, the council engaged in discussion with sanctuary staff.

GFNMS AC Community-at-Large Marin County member George Clyde asked about why it is important to keep invasive European green crab numbers low within Bolinas Lagoon. He noted that they have already spread throughout the state. GFNMS/CBNMS Resource Protection Coordinator Karen Reyna noted that green crabs can out compete native species to a detriment to the lagoon's overall ecosystem.

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. Francesca Koe motioned to support the staff recommendations with Sanctuary Advisory Council edits. George Clyde seconded.

GFNMS AC MOTION: To support recommendations within Bolinas Lagoon

Vote: 12 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_actions.html.

GFNMS Advisory Council Business

The council welcomed two new members: Jacqueline Moore, who will serve as the Maritime Commercial Activities member, and Peter Molnar, who will serve as the Maritime Recreational Activities alternate.

The council approved the draft meeting highlights from the December 2022 council meeting. George Clyde motioned to approve the highlights and Bibit Traut seconded.

GFNMS AC MOTION: Approve February 2023 meeting highlights

Vote: 11 yes, 0 no, 1 abstain

A copy of the meeting highlights is available upon request to tishma.patel@noaa.gov, and it will be posted online at https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_meetings.html.

A new council executive committee was elected by majority vote of members. The executive committee consists of the council chair, vice chair, and secretary. Abby Mohan was voted in as council chair for a second consecutive term. Bibit Traut was voted in as council vice chair for the second consecutive term. Finally, George Clyde was voted in as council secretary for his first term. The terms for these positions are two years each and terms are set to begin at the next council meeting in July.

GFNMS AC Member and Alternate Reports

Craig Kenkel, National Park Service:

- Nesting season started
- Harbor seal counts occurring
- Point Reyes watersampling and testing last fall as required by Coastal Commission - seeing anomalies related to atmospheric rivers; important in that these watersheds are draining into Drake's and Tomales Bay.

Jacqueline Moore, Maritime Commercial Activities:

- Regarding California Assembly Bill 953, the Pacific Merchant Shipping Association is moving to support the bill along with NOAA
- Will bring updates regarding ballast water to the next meeting

Sarah Bates, Commercial Fishing:

- Commercial and Recreational salmon seasons are closed. Recommend Black Cod as a consumer alternative to support the local fleet.

- Gear recovery program in San Francisco; actively pulling out lost crab gear so that it doesn't cause entanglement.

Richard Ogg, Commercial Fishing:

- Crabbing season has been tough with restrictions and current prices being paid for crab

Peter Molnar, Maritime Recreational Activities:

- Engaged in kelp restoration surveys south of timber cover; training recreational abalone divers on proper methods of urchin removal

Abby Mohan, Maritime Recreational Activities:

- Opening day on the SF Bay next week
- Seeing whales in the bay - they are coming really close
- Beginning of recreational charter boat season

Bart Selby, Community-at-Large San Francisco/San Mateo:

- Attended International Ocean Film Festival
- Interesting article in Time magazine about dogs disturbing wildlife
- Issue at Pillar Point Harbor regarding individuals who bring dogs to chase birds
- Pupping season San Mateo County coast
- Harbor seals - article in Alameda Post regarding harbor seals disturbance issue. Alameda County has built floats away from the shore, and the locals have adopted the seals and they police it. It makes a big difference that they have "adopted" the seals, and it creates awareness. In San Mateo County, propeller cuts are a big issue; non-commercial boats are going too fast

Ellen Hines, Research:

- Attending the International Whale Research Committee.
- Nearly all of her students are working on projects in the Greater Farallones area
- Teaming up with new scientists - putting up floating buoys for marine mammal research, looking at sperm whales and acoustics of harbor porpoises, ship strike and entanglement risk
- Two students on Southeast Farallon Island - one looking at microplastics, one looking at sea lion feces

Richard James, Community-at-Large Marin County:

- There's a current California Assembly Bill focused on abandoned vessels in the delta.
- Pier 39 sea lion disturbance
- Helped facilitate recovery of buoys in Tomales Bay
- Issue of people camping without toilets on Tomales Bay; people are instructed how to properly behave in their permits, but they do not comply

Kathi George, Conservation:

- Pupping season
 - Currently on site at The Marine Mammal Center: 80 elephant seals, 12 harbor seals, 6 seal lions, and steller sea lions; not at max for the time of year though.

- There have been two gray whale vessel strikes in March and April in Bolinas and in the SF Bay; SF Bay whale also had entanglement
- Two humpback whales in Monterey entangled in the last week - no details now. Trying to alert the Coast Guard when they are in the bay
- Whale Safe acoustic buoys offshore within the Gulf of the Farallones; fin, humpback, and blue whales heard

Bibit Traut, Education:

- Thinking about the role of educators and looking beyond academia to being supportive of community initiatives; for example, supporting artists
- Trying to be more engaged with the community and play a positive role

Francesca Koe, Conservation:

- 18th Annual California Ocean Day
- Capitol Hill Ocean Week coming up in June

Jaime Jahncke, Research:

- Attended California Ocean Acidification and Hypoxia Workshop - hosted by OPC and Sea Grant; included various stakeholders; effort on data sharing; they are working on data portal; only shore stations now but growing to include MPAs (has included ACCESS data for past 10 years).
- Attended another workshop on Other Effective Conservation Measures (or OECMs)

Meeting highlights prepared by Jordan Gorostiza, Advisory Council Coordinator.

Appendix I. GFNMSAC Attendance for the February 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting

Name	Seat	Attendance
Sarah Bates	Commercial Fishing (Member)	Y
Richard Ogg	Commercial Fishing (Alternate)	Y
George Clyde	Community-at-Large Marin (Member)	Y
Richard James	Community-at-Large Marin (Alternate)	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Member)	--
Vacant	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Alternate)	--
Bart Selby	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Member)	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Alternate)	--
Francesca Koe	Conservation (Member)	Y
Kathi George	Conservation (Member)	Y
Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--

Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--
Bibit Traut	Education (Member)	Y
Mary Miller	Education (Alternate)	N
Jacqueline Moore	Maritime Commercial Activities (Member)	Y
Vacant	Maritime Commercial Activities (Alternate)	--
Abby Mohan	Maritime Recreational Activities (Member)	Y
Peter Molnar	Maritime Recreational Activities (Alternate)	Y
Jaime Jahncke	Research (Member)	Y
Ellen Hines	Research (Alternate)	Y
Vacant	Youth (Member)	--
Vacant	Youth (Alternate)	--
Jenn Eckerle	California Department of Natural Resources (Member)	N

Michael Esgro	California Department of Natural Resources (Alternate)	Y
Craig Kenkel	National Park Service (Member)	Y
Ben Becker	National Park Service (Alternate)	N
LT Lelea Lingo	U.S. Coast Guard (Member)	N
LTJG Andrew Kang	U.S. Coast Guard (Alternate)	N
Matthew Brown	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Member)	Y
Gerry McChesney	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Alternate)	N
Jennifer Boyce	National Marine Fisheries Service (Member)	N
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Alternate)	--
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Member)	N
Mike Murray	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Member)	Y
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N

Appendix II. CBNMSAC Attendance for the February 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting

Name	Seat	Attendance
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--
Frank Capurro	Community-at-Large Sonoma	N
Steve Tubbs	Community-at-Large Sonoma	Y
Scott Artis	Conservation	Y
Morgan Patton	Conservation	N
Vacant	Education	--
Vacant	Education	--
Chris Ohanian	Fishing	Y
Vacant	Fishing	--
Vacant	Maritime Activities	--

Kai Martin (Chair)	Maritime Activities	Y
Jeff Dorman	Research	Y
Chrissy Piotrowski	Research	Y
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting member)	Y
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting alternate)	N
LT Kynan Barrios	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting member)	Y
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting alternate)	--
LT Lelea Lingo	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting member)	N
LTJG Andrew Kang	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting alternate)	N