



GREATER FARALLONES and CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARIES
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Thursday, August 18, 2022

9:00AM – 3:35PM PT

Virtual via Google Meet

MEETING HIGHLIGHTS

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS), Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS), or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

To view slides from any presentation referenced in this document, please email jordan.gorostiza@noaa.gov.

Welcome, Roll Call, Review Agenda

CBNMS Advisory Council Chair Kai Martin welcomed all to the meeting. Council Coordinator Jordan Gorostiza called roll for the CBNMS Advisory Council. Chair Kai Martin introduced the GFNMS Advisory Council Chair Abby Mohan to call roll for the GFNMS Advisory Council. The councils reviewed and approved the day's agenda unanimously.

CBNMS Advisory Council Business

The council approved the draft meeting highlights from the April 14, 2022 meeting. Vice Chair Irma Cuevas offered a motion to approve the highlights which was seconded by Richard Ogg. Chair Kai Martin led the vote. There were no oppositions or abstentions to the vote. A copy of the April meeting highlights will be posted online at <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/documents.html>.

Jordan provided an update on recruitment efforts for the CBNMS Advisory Council. During the summer recruitment period, the council solicited applicants for both its Fishing Seat and its Education Seat. Jordan received only one applicant for the Fishing Seat and no applicants for the Education Seat. Following the review process of the application received, another recruitment will be opened to fill the other vacancies.

Member and Alternate Reports

See Appendix IV below for member and alternate reports.

Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuaries Superintendent's Report

Maria Brown, Superintendent of Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuaries (GFNMS and CBNMS, respectively), provided updates on GFNMS and CBNMS Operations, Research, Education/Outreach, and Resource Protection program activities since the last council meetings in April and May.

Highlights from the report include 1) the sanctuary taking possession of a 22 foot Zodiac Hurricane for Tomales Bay operations, 2) the successful completion of two Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS)

cruises within GFNMS, CBNMS, and northern Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS), 3) the CBNMS Condition Report was distributed for peer review, 4) the GFNMS Condition Report Status and Trends workshops were completed in July, and 5) staff supported an area familiarization with the State of California focused on areas that the California Fish and Game Commission may review for a new aquaculture lease.

Superintendent Maria Brown's presentation also covered recent permit activity within GFNMS and CBNMS. Chair Kai Martin asked Maria if the sanctuary shares permits that were not approved by the sanctuary. Maria clarified that the sanctuary does not share that information with the council. She noted that it is rare that the sanctuary does not approve a permit, and if they do, it is usually due to the sanctuary deeming a permit is not required.

Ellen Hines, GFNMS Advisory Council Research Alternate, asked for clarification on a permit regarding "attracting white sharks to a vessel." Superintendent Brown clarified that GFNMS regulations do not allow for the attraction or approaching of white sharks. Attracting white sharks in the sanctuary requires a permit. GFNMS permitted researchers to use bait to attract white sharks who have also been permitted by the California Department of Fish and Wildlife and the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) to tag and take small tissue samples of the sharks. GFNMS has issued education permits to white shark tour operators allowing the operators to attract white sharks with decoys.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Lisa Wooninck, Superintendent of MBNMS, provided a brief report on recent and upcoming events at the sanctuary. Highlights included 1) the announcement of new MBNMS Advisory Council Coordinator, Haven Parker, 2) the presentation of preliminary data from a recent MBNMS ACCESS cruise and survey of the Davidson Seamount, and 3) that the MBNMS Sea Star Gala and Sanctuary Fest were happening the weekend of September 17 and 18.

In response to the MBNMS ACCESS cruise data presented on crab pot locations that were reported to the California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW), Sara Bates, GFNMS Advisory Council Fishing Seat alternate, informed Lisa that MBNMS could also send the locations to one of the CDFW crab pot retrieval permit holders and they can work to remove the pots quicker than CDFW typically can.

In the Google Meet chatbox, a member of the public inquired about MBNMS' outreach for survival tactics on the water. Lisa responded that MBNMS works to coordinate these efforts with partners, however other agencies are better positioned for this type of programming.

Public Comment

There were no members of the public who wished to provide a comment.

GFNMS and CBNMS Vessel Speed Reduction Efforts and Response to Joint Ship Strike Working Group Recommendations

Michael Carver, Operations Coordinator for GFNMS and CBNMS, provided a presentation on the 2022 voluntary vessel speed reduction (VSR) efforts and GFNMS/CBNMS' response to both councils' recommendations to the sanctuary on how to reduce the risk of lethal ship strikes to endangered whales.

In response to the 2022 council recommendations, Michael highlighted that the sanctuary is implementing the recommendations by 1) extending the voluntary VSR season from May 1 to December 15, 2) expanding the

voluntary VSR to encompass all of GFNMS, CBNMS, and within the Southern Traffic Separation Scheme (TSS) in MBNMS, and 3) contracting with Point Blue Conservation Science to evaluate the conservation benefits of various lane change scenarios for the San Francisco TSS, expanding the voluntary VSR throughout the entirety of GFNMS and CBNMS, and moving from a seasonal voluntary VSR to a year round voluntary VSR. Further, if deemed necessary to achieve the stated goal of reducing fatal ship strike risk by 50%, the sanctuary will consider mandatory speed limits during its upcoming management plan review process.

Jeff Dorman, CBNMS Advisory Council Research Member, asked Michael what the level of compliance has been with companies this year and if companies have adjusted quickly. Michael responded that they do not monitor data frequently, but that preliminary data are positive.

GFNMS/CBNMS Climate Vulnerability Assessment Presentation

Sara Hutto, Conservation and Climate Program Coordinator (NOAA affiliate) with the Greater Farallones Association, provided a presentation on the upcoming Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment update for both GFNMS and CBNMS.

Sara provided an overview on climate change vulnerability and on the process by which sanctuaries undergo climate change vulnerability assessments. She explained that climate vulnerability assessments attempt to rank resources by their vulnerability with scores for certain indicators that assess vulnerability. Vulnerability assessments can 1) help prioritize species and systems for management actions, 2) inform management strategies to address climate change, and 3) efficiently allocate sanctuary resources. GFNMS and CBNMS will undergo the process of updating their 2014 vulnerability assessments throughout the last half of 2022 and into 2023. This update to the assessments will inform the GFNMS and CBNMS management plan review in 2023.

Cea Higgins, Community at Large - Sonoma/Mendocino Member, mentioned that the goal of the report is not just to document vulnerabilities, but to provide recommendations. She highlighted that she has observed that during days with low king tides and warmer temperatures, there is increased visitation to certain accessible sites within the sanctuary which increases the likelihood of die-offs. She inquired if there was a way for management to utilize resources of agencies who have staff in those areas to educate the public on how to interact with the sanctuary during these events. Superintendent Maria Brown responded by noting that sanctuary staff do alert CDFW when these low tides occur, particularly in San Mateo County. Maria noted that if there are sites in Marin and Sonoma Counties where this is also occurring, council members can reach out to Max Delaney, max.delaney@noaa.gov, so that he can coordinate with officials in those counties. Karen Reyna, Resource Protection Coordinator with GFNMS and CBNMS, noted that the sanctuary does coordinate this for Duxbury Reef, Marin County, and Pillar Point, San Mateo County.

Chair Kai Martin asked Sara if the sanctuaries are anticipating to see major or minor changes to the initial climate vulnerability assessment. Sara noted that there are some resources, such as kelp forests, that will likely be deemed more vulnerable for this update.

Presentation on Alternatives to Traditional Dungeness Crab Fishing Equipment to Reduce Entanglements of Whales

Kathi George, GFNMS Advisory Council Conservation Member, and Richard Ogg, GFNMS Advisory Council Conservation Alternate, provided an overview of potential alternatives to traditional dungeness crab fishing gear to reduce entanglements of whales.

The presentation highlighted ongoing work in the state via the California Dungeness Crab Fishing Gear Working Group and Risk Assessment and Mitigation Program (RAMP). Kathi and Richard also overviewed gear innovations currently being tested.

Richard James, GFNMS Advisory Council Community at Large - Marin Alternate, inquired about work mitigating unmarked gear pertaining to fisheries other than the dungeness crab fishery. Kathi noted that it is important to be able to identify fisheries, but that she is not sure if it is feasible to do line marking for each individual fishery. Richard Ogg agreed and noted that there are ways to do line marking in this way, however it is expensive to do so.

Cea Higgins asked Richard Ogg to explain how gear is reset with and without a crew. Richard noted that current gear innovations are not made with the understanding that time is critical for commercial fishermen. Richard explained that redeploying these new innovations is timely and can add hours to already long work days for crew. He ended by noting that these innovations need to be “crew” proof to help allow for widespread adoption by fishermen.

Sarah Bates, GFNMS Advisory Council Commercial Fishing Alternate, asked Richard and Kathi to talk about success rates for retrieval of alternative gear. Richard noted that retrieval is approximately at 95% success.

Review of Sanctuary Education Programs

Carol Preston, GFNMS/CBNMS Education and Outreach Coordinator, provided an overview of GFNMS education programs. Carol’s presentation provided metrics on sanctuary visitor center programs, virtual education programs, exhibits, interpretive signage, volunteer and docent numbers, engagement in the site’s “Get into Your Sanctuary” initiative, sanctuary hosted soirees, family workshops and summer camps, and special events such as the annual Sharktoberfest celebration.

Mary Miller, GFNMS Advisory Council Education Alternate, highlighted potential future partnerships that GFNMS and CBNMS could engage in including with the Bolinas Research Center, Noyo Center, and pertaining to the United Nations’ Decade for Ocean Science for Sustainable Development.

Richard James noted that there are a lot of youth education programs, and inquired about efforts to educate and outreach to those that are already interested such as the recreational fishing community. Carol noted that the sanctuary outreaches to recreational fishermen, however the education team does not currently have programming for this community.

Bibit Traut, GFNMS Advisory Council Vice Chair and Education Member, requested an update on the sanctuary’s partnership with the San Francisco Zoo. Carol noted that there is a partnership there but that it is currently focused on docent training and signage.

Richard Ogg noted that he is trying to educate fishermen to reduce the amount of fishing gear and debris left along the coast and in the ocean. He inquired if there was a facility or a way to help these efforts. Carol highlighted that the Seabird Protection Network does a lot of outreach on this front.

Superintendent Maria Brown let the councils know that the GFNMS and CBNMS management plan review process will have opportunities to engage on how the sanctuary should move forward with its education

programming. She noted that one potential way to engage on this front would be to examine the messages and audiences that the Education and Outreach team should prioritize. Maria informed the councils that they could also establish a subcommittee or working group to provide formal recommendations to the sanctuary.

GFNMS AC Vessel Incidents Subcommittee: Regulatory recommendations and council discussion

Cea Higgins, Chair of the GFNMS Advisory Council Vessel Incidents Subcommittee, walked the GFNMS Advisory Council through the regulatory recommendations of the subcommittee. Cea noted that this is a first suite of recommendations and that non-regulatory recommendations would be coming at the December GFNMS Advisory Council meeting.

The Vessel Incident Subcommittee recommended 1) changes to the ONMS definition of “deserting,” 2) to add language to GFNMS Prohibited or otherwise regulated activities, 3) a reasonable anchorage limit on Tomales Bay, 4) the creation of a GFNMS Vessel Desertion Checklist, and 5) that GFNMS define the term *marine debris*.

The full council provided their feedback and suggested edits to the subcommittee’s recommendations. The council then voted to adopt all recommendations of the subcommittee, except for the reasonable anchorage limit on Tomales Bay, and to forward those recommendations to Superintendent Maria Brown. The council agreed to further discuss the anchorage limit recommendation at their December 2022 meeting.

All council actions can be viewed online at https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_actions.html.

GFNMS Advisory Council Business

The council approved the draft meeting highlights from the May 26, 2022 meeting. Jaime Jahncke, Research Member, offered a motion to approve the highlights which was seconded by Richard Ogg. Chair Abby Mohan led the vote. There was one abstention and no opposition to the vote. A copy of the May meeting highlights will be posted online at https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_meetings.html.

Mary Miller requested the council discuss sending a letter of support for the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary (FKNMS) Restoration Blueprint. In particular, Mary wanted to commend the site for their excellent public communication rollout. The council voted unanimously to draft the letter and requested that Superintendent Maria Brown submit the letter on behalf of the council.

Council coordinator Jordan Gorostiza provided an update on council recruitment. He noted that the application period ended on Monday, August 15. He highlighted that the council received at least one application for each of its vacant seats except for the Youth Alternate. He said that he would be coordinating the preliminary review panel meeting to review applications in the coming weeks. George Clyde, Community at Large Marin Member, volunteered to join the panel.

Wrap Up and Adjourn

Chairs Kai Martin and Abby Mohan adjourned the meeting.

Appendix I. CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting Attendance and Voting Record for August 18, 2022

Name	Seat	Attend.	Agenda	April Highlights
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--	--	--
Rob Taboada	Community-at-Large Marin	N	--	--
Frank Capurro	Community-at-Large Sonoma	N	--	--
Steve Tubbs	Community-at-Large Sonoma	Y	Y	Y
Scott Artis	Conservation	Y	Y	Y
Morgan Patton	Conservation	Y	Y	Y
Irma Cuevas (Vice-Chair)	Education	Y	Y	Y
Vacant	Education	--	--	--
Richard Ogg	Fishing	Y	Y	Y
Noah Wagner	Fishing	Y	Y	Y
Chris Hendry	Maritime Activities	N	--	--
Kai Martin (Chair)	Maritime Activities	Y	Y	Y
Jeff Dorman	Research	Y	Y	Y
Chrissy Piotrowski	Research	Y	Y	Y
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting member)	Y	--	--
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting alternate)	N	--	--
LT Kynan Barrios	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting member)	Y	--	--
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting alternate)	--	--	--
LT Lelea Lingo	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting member)	N	--	--
LTJG Andrew Kang	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting alternate)	N	--	--

Appendix II. GFNMS Advisory Council Meeting Attendance and Voting Record for August 18, 2022

Name	Seat	Attend.	Agenda	May Highlights	ONMS Definition of Deserting	GFNMS Reg. Recommendations	FKNMS Letter of Support
Barbara Emley	Commercial Fishing (Primary)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Sarah Bates	Commercial Fishing (Alternate)	Y	Y	Y	--	--	--
George Clyde	Community-at-Large Marin (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Richard James	Community-at-Large Marin (Alternate)	Y		--	--	--	--
Cea Higgins	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Primary)	Y		ABSTAIN	Y	Y	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Alternate)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Vacant	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Primary)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Kris Lannin Liang	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Francesca Koe	Conservation (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Kathi George	Conservation (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Richard Ogg	Conservation (Alternate)	Y		--	--	--	--
Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Bibit Traut	Education (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Mary Miller	Education (Alternate)	Y		--	--	--	--

John Berge	Maritime Activities - Commercial (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Julian Rose	Maritime Activities - Commercial (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Abby Mohan	Maritime Activities - Recreation (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Vacant	Maritime Activities - Recreation (Alternate)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Jaime Jahncke	Research (Primary)	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Ellen Hines	Research (Alternate)	Y	--	--	--	--	--
Vacant	Youth (Primary)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Vacant	Youth (Alternate)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Mark Gold	California Department of Natural Resources (Primary)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Michael Esgro	California Department of Natural Resources (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Craig Kenkel	National Park Service (Primary)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ben Becker	National Park Service (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
LT Lelea Lingo	U.S. Coast Guard (Primary)	N	--	--	--	--	--
LTJG Andrew Kang	U.S. Coast Guard (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Chris Barr	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Primary)	N	--	--	--	--	--

Gerry McChesney	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Jennifer Boyce	National Marine Fisheries Service (Primary)	Y	--	--	--	--	--
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Alternate)	--	--	--	--	--	--
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Primary)	Y	--	--	--	--	--
Mike Murray	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Primary)	Y	--	--	--	--	--
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N	--	--	--	--	--



Appendix III. GFNMS/CBNMS Staff and Members of the Public Present on August 18, 2022

Sanctuary staff present: Maria Brown, Superintendent; Jordan Gorostiza (Affiliate), Advisory Council Coordinator; Tishma Patel (Affiliate), Administrative Assistant; Danielle Lipski, Research Coordinator; Jan Roletto, Research Coordinator; Jennifer Stock, Education and Outreach Coordinator; Max Delaney, Resource Protection Specialist; Karen Reyna, Resource Protection Coordinator; Carol Preston, Education and Outreach Coordinator

Others present: Paul Forward, Angela Zepp, Deb Self, Gina Contolini, Jessica Morten, Michael Carver, Monisha Sugla, Morgan Ivens-Duran, Rietta Hohman, Haven Parker, Sara Hutto

Appendix IV. CBNMS Advisory Council Member and Alternate Reports provided on August 18, 2022

Steve Tubbs noted that he is continuing with outreach via social media with information on CBNMS and National Marine Sanctuaries.

Scott Artis highlighted that there were 1,800 coho this year in the watershed, bringing the total population to 4,500 in the San Geronimo Valley. He also noted there are 890 steelhead there which is below the average as well. Scott highlighted that Turtle Island Restoration Networks is working with new personnel and also has opportunities for ocean education and advocacy.

Morgan Patton highlighted upcoming Marin Environmental Action Committee events and topics of interest including 1) a summer pop-up educational exhibit highlighting national marine sanctuaries and marine protected areas, 2) an open house and reception with Jenny Stock and someone from NMFS to talk to the public, 3) Tomales Oyster Company had their aquaculture permit approved, and 4) A partnership with Marin, Mendocino and Sonoma counties to work on decreasing plastic that will get published and distributed to the public.

Irma Cuevas highlighted that in July she went to the Oakland Museum to view the CBNMS exhibit. She noted that some information needed to be updated. Through her role with the City of Santa Rosa, she led a family outing with formerly incarcerated youth and their families and was able to take them out and share information about CBNMS, Bodega Marine Lab, and the coast.

Richard Ogg highlighted that salmon season has been better, but that weather has been tough with the short season. He also noted that the trucking of the hatchery fish has made a significant difference in the overall abundance in the ocean. He has seen a larger volume of Coho Salmon, and they are bigger weight-wise than in the past and they are found in different depths rather than only near the surface.

Kai Martin noted that CA passed their commercial harbor craft update to regulations, and that there are studies being conducted if it is possible to retrofit existing harbor craft or purchase new ones.

Noah Wagner echoed Richard Ogg's statements, and noted that there is 100% occupancy out in Bodega Bay. He has been working on the marine debris removal grant and they are finding it difficult to find the older vessels to meet the requirement for the grant. They are looking for partnerships to fulfill it.

Jeff Dorman noted that the upwelling season has been intense. The NOAA cruises have been impacted by COVID-19 and staffing issues.

Chrissy Piotrowski is looking forward to the field season. She has been digitizing records which included species records from CBNMS. She noted that in September, there will be a meeting with naturalist staff at the California Academy of Sciences, and the topic may be climate and ocean changes.

Kynan Barrios highlighted recent staffing updates to NOAA OLE and noted that they would be attempting to get into GFNMS and CBNMS to patrol in the near future.