



**GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS)
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING**

Pt. Reyes Red Barn Classroom
9:30 a.m. – 4:30 p.m.
Thursday, May 12, 2011

Note: The following meeting highlights are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA

Acting Advisory Council Chair, Barbara Emley, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Copies to:

Carol Bernthal, ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Review Agenda:

The agenda was approved with no changes.

Swearing-In of New Council Member

US Fish and Wildlife Service Seat, Mendel Stewart and Alternate Gerry McChesney were not present. They will be present at August meeting to be sworn in.

Superintendent's Report

Maria Brown recognized the work of Bob Breen, the Sanctuary Advisory Council Volunteer of the Year. She also recognized John Largier, recipient of the GFNMS Volunteer of the Year, for his work on the climate change impact reports working group, and as editor of the GFNMS Condition Report last year.

Budget –

A Continuing Resolution was passed in April and NOAA received a budget cut. ONMS hopes to get budget numbers in the coming weeks. As a result of decreased budget allocations, GFNMS is unable to contribute money to the RV Fulmar this year. Maria Brown will meet with Bill Douros and Carol Bernthal to discuss how to maintain West Coast research vessels.

Permits –

Feb 8th: GFNMS issued a letter of authorization to Jan Roletto (GFNMS) to maintain 28 existing quadrats on Southeast Farallon Islands for research.

Feb 9th: GFNMS issued a letter of authorization to Dr. Julie Thomas, Coastal Data Information Program, Scripps Institute of Oceanography, for replacement of data buoy located 18nm west of San Francisco.



March 9th: GFNMS issued a research permit to Dr. Stacy Kim, Moss Landing Marine Laboratory, for collection of epifaunal, benthic infaunal and sediment samples in Tomales Bay and Elkhorn Slough, for the purpose of identifying non-indigenous species.

May 3rd: GFNMS issued an education permit to Shepherd/Steinhart Aquarium/CA Academy of Sciences for collection of marine substrates for aquarium exhibits in North Pigeon Point, Pillar Point Harbor, Duxbury Reef and shale beds off Del Monte Beach in Monterey

Permits Under Review- There are two permits currently under review. The first is an education permit for ecotourism trips for the general public to James Moskito, Great White Adventures. The second is a research permit for long-term tracking of adult white sharks to Dr. Michael Domeier, Marine Conservation Science Institute. Maria Brown noted that recently, a new paper has been published on white shark populations, and a video of a tagged white shark has been released. As this constitutes new information that should inform this permitting decision, GFNMS will put their Environmental Assessment out for review again.

Half Moon Bay Office – Due to budget cuts, the Half Moon Bay Office will be closed on May 31, 2011. Staff will be relocated to the San Francisco office.

Motorized Personal Watercraft – Paul Michel and Maria Brown submitted an Op Ed to the San Francisco Chronicle and Santa Cruz Sentinel to clarify the role and position of the sanctuaries in the use of MPWCs in sanctuary waters. Maria Brown reiterated that the sanctuaries do not have authority to regulate public safety. Rather, public safety agencies may train certified volunteers to conduct safety operations. A letter was sent to the San Mateo County Sheriff's Department affirming that, if desired, that entity can have a volunteer surf rescue unit, as provided for under sanctuary regulation. A discussion followed regarding educating the community on this issue. Various list-serves, local newspapers, social media and surf groups were discussed.

Bolinas Lagoon Update- On May 11, 2011, GFNMS hosted a town hall meeting in Bolinas to update the community on recent activities:

- The US Army Corps of Engineers (Corps) and Marin County have restructured their partnership to improve efficiency of the project. This restructured partnership will allow the Corps to bypass Congressional approval when projects are ready for construction.
- Caltrans roadwork will begin their culvert replacement, rock slope protection repair, and pullout pavement project later this summer and should finish by year's end. Additionally, GFNMS continues to work on the timeline and process steps for the Kent Island Invasive Species Removal project.
- GFNMS staff also met with Marin County Department of Public Works to discuss a future culvert cleaning project adjacent to the lagoon and secured their support for future restoration projects involving county lands.

Agenda Protocols: The Council Executive Committee consists of the Superintendent, the Council Coordinator and the Advisory Council officers. This group develops the draft agendas, which are then finalized by sanctuary staff. All members of the committee are asked to ensure



that information discussed during these preliminary meetings does not get out to the public until the agenda is finalized and distributed to the entire council.

Member Reports (Barbara Emley)

Cicely Muldoon, National Park Service: The Oyster Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) is ongoing at Pt Reyes. The Park Service received over 4000 comments from all over country. The next public comment period for the Draft EIS coming out this fall.

George Clyde, Maritime Activities/Recreation: George had two successful salmon fishing trips in sanctuary this year. George recommended using the VHF marine radio as a means of educating mariners.

Peter Grenell, Maritime Activities/Commercial-

- Fishing and sanctuary related interpretive sign panels are close to installation. The unveiling ceremony is tentatively planned for June 2011.
- San Mateo Coast Visitors Center – The Harbor District is currently working on developing a site with a small commercial development in Pillar Point Harbor. The site is the perched beach where Half Moon Bay Kayaks is located. This development could potentially support a Sanctuary Visitors Center, as well as administrative offices and other marine-related uses. Site development is currently focused on design for protective bulkhead. The Harbor District is working with Kelley Higgason (GFNMS) for sea level rise considerations. The process is moving forward, with a likely Programmatic Environmental Impact Report in the future.
- Surfer's Beach project – Surfer's Beach, just outside of Pillar Point Harbor, is the focus of a current shoreline erosion control project. The Army Corps of Engineers will be having a Public Meeting on June 6th at the Half Moon Bay Yacht Club. A multi-agency working group (sponsored by Pillar point Harbor and GFNMS/MBNMS is a participant) will be present. The Project is in a pre-construction study phase to identify the current conditions at Surfer's Beach.
- Mavericks Surf Contest- A new group, Mavericks Community LLC has applied for a limited commercial activity permit to hold the Surf Contest next year. Katherine Clark, (formerly of Half Moon Bay surf group, who were awarded the permit last year) is the point person for this permit. Conditions of the permit remain the same as last year.
- Salmon Pens- The Harbor Commission has just authorized and approved support for the construction of temporary salmon pens in outer Pillar Point Harbor. Pens will help Chinook salmon to survive transition from Sacramento river to the ocean. Smolt are generally trucked downriver and many die when put straight into the ocean. The pens will allow salmon to acclimatize before they are released. This project is in cooperation with CA Department of Fish and Game.
- Community Supported Fisheries are a new thing that the public and Google support to encourage sustainable fishing practices. There may be some sort of future support or partnership.



Jaime Jahncke, Research: The first ACCESS cruise for the year is May 23rd, with more in June, July, and September. There are several graduate research projects underway as well. Last Monday there was meeting at PRBO to discuss ACCESS data, upgrading into newer model that will have GIS capabilities and to improve the utility of the data.

Dominique Richard, Community-At-Large/Marin and Sonoma- Dominique attended a meeting about shellfish in Tomales Bay. The EPA and California Coastal Commission were represented at the meeting. Brad Damitz presented the vessel management plan. In other news, a survey of Drakes beach last weekend shows that harbor seals are doing well.

Rich Kuehn, Community-At-Large, Marin/Sonoma– Richard attended the sanctuary harbor porpoise lecture, which was excellent and very well-received.

Jackie Dragon, Conservation- Pacific Environment is the sponsor of a bill for oil spill preparedness and is working to build consensus. The bill addresses the deficit in agency responsibility in protecting the marine environment from oil spills. It also addresses the threat of spills from ships re-fueling and bunkering in SF Bay. A similar bill was passed and then was vetoed last year. Jackie is now working for Greenpeace.

Bob Breen, Education- MPA Watch with volunteers will be applying to Montara State Marine Reserve, with the blessing of the Department of Fish and Game. Bob has a copy of protocols if anyone would like to see them. Thanks to Bob Wilson for coming out to do a video of the reserves, which will be distributed to teachers who bring children on discovery walks.

Kellyx Nelson, Community-At-Large, San Francisco/San Mateo – The Resource Conservation District is conducting a study of fecal contamination on beaches of harbor. The Rural Roads program is delivering information on sediment distribution in spawning habitat. There is currently a study to reduce nutrient load into Año Nuevo and Fitzgerald Marine Reserve. The San Mateo County Resource Conservation District is working with first flush on these programs.

Bob Wilson, Conservation - FMSA has budget challenges and will be working towards increasing funding. FMSA has created a krill club which will allow donors to give a small amount of money every month, making it an easy way to donate. Important programs need your support. See Bob for membership information.

John Largier, Research – John listed ongoing research in the sanctuary, including: climate studies, ACCESS cruises, rockfish cruises, ongoing work through PRBO, ocean acidification, shark behavior and ecology work, MLPA monitoring in north central region. Jan Roletto and John have been organizing FMSA, GFNMS, CBNMS and UC Davis Bodega Marine Lab, National Park Service, SF Bay National Estuarine Research Reserve to put together a research symposium on November 5th.

Barbara Emley, Maritime Activities/Commercial- The region has been very windy and it is unclear what the fishing season will be like. Water diversions have been large piece of why there hasn't been fishing. The San Joaquin water agencies issued an injunction to prevent fishing.



There is a concern that infrastructure will start to fail when there is no fishing for a number of years.

Advisory Council Business (Maria Brown & Leslie Abramson)

Motion to approve the December 2010 and Feb 2011 Joint Key Meeting Outcomes:

Motion: Bob Wilson

Second: Tim Duff

Vote: Jaime Jahncke

Action Item: Form Review Subcommittee for Education Alternate Seat

Bob Breen, Cicely Muldoon and Dominique Richard agreed to form a Review Subcommittee in order to evaluate the application for Education Alternate seat.

SAC West Coast Region Quarterly Report – Please see:

http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/sac_report.html

SAC Summit Update:

To view the Summit Agenda, go to:

<http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/management/pdfs/sacsummitagenda11.pdf>

Leslie Abramson is the Advisory Council representative for the West Coast Region. Items of priority in the Summit were:

- Re-activation of the Site Evaluation List
- Creation of a National Advisory Council
- Creation of a Youth Seat on Advisory Councils

Discussion: Many SAC members expressed concerns about the formation of a National Advisory Council. It was agreed that the issue be placed on the next SAC meeting agenda and recommendations will be sent to Headquarters.

Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan (Karen Reyna)

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/tbvmp_history.pdf

Discussion: The SAC discussed moorings and which types are most cost effective. George Clyde, Maritime Activities/Recreation, stated that everyone in the Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan Working Group is in favor of a permitting process for moorings.

Kellyx Nelson, Community-At-Large, San Francisco/San Mateo asked about the potential environmental benefits to a vessel management plan. Maria Brown explained that the benefits would be “incredibly significant”. Currently, GFNMS regulations prohibit placing anything on the seabed. However, there are over 100 illegal moorings at this time. This plan is a mechanism to allow people to legally moor their boats. The net environmental benefit will be quantified in the Environmental Assessment, which will be released soon.



George Clyde, Maritime Activities/Recreation, objected to an “anti-vessel attitude” throughout the vessel management plan process. He objected to the use of power-point slides that suggest vessel owners are irresponsible or “trashing” Tomales Bay. He further stated that the plan fails to address live-aboard vessels. In his opinion, oyster beds cause more damage than moorings to eelgrass.

Public Comment

Jerry Abbot, from the Tomales Bay Watershed Council, stated that boaters and the community are collaborating with government agencies on the Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan. Abbot said that the boaters and community want to be regulated and desire a no-discharge zone in Tomales Bay. He also stated that the number of moorings located in eelgrass is very small, and that the community wishes to have them removed.

A discussion followed regarding the ability of the Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan to address live-aboard vessels. Karen Reyna (GFNMS) stated that the County of Marin has the authority to address this issue.

LUNCH

Ocean Climate Initiative (Kelley Higgason)

Our Coast, Our Future Update

See OCOF one-page summary at:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/ocofsummary.pdf

West Coast Ocean Acidification Plan-

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/wcr_oaplan.pdf

A discussion followed about monitoring indicator species such as aragonite calcifiers and pH measurements. It was also mentioned that monitoring has been integrated into the ACCESS cruises, but more funding is needed. It was also emphasized that sanctuaries should collaborate with state and regional bodies such as the Ocean Protection Council and Ocean Science Trust, as well as the West Coast Governor’s Agreement.

White Shark Environmental Assessment Update (Carliane Johnson)

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/sharksupdate.pdf

Discussion: SAC members asked how Domeier’s tag differs from other researchers. Carliane stated that Domeier’s tag has the ability to collect long term, real-time data vs. historic data. Bob Wilson stated that he believes that an Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) will be necessary for this issue. Carliane responded by saying that the requirements for an Environmental Assessment and EIS are virtually identical. An EIS is done when you don’t know the magnitude of the impacts, if the finding is that there is significant effects, you are moved to another stage of analysis.



John Largier stated that resources are going to permit assessments, and the bigger this issue gets, the more resources are going to it. There is an opportunity cost to doing this, as GFNMS can't afford it. Maria Brown responded by saying we are obligated to review all permit applications we receive, and cannot deny a permit based on controversy.

Public Comment

Greg Baron, Incredible Adventures stated that the decision to issue or deny the the permit should be based on accurate data. He believes that images on-line are manipulated, and do not tell the whole story.

Sean Van Sommeran, Pelagic Shark Research Foundation made comments in opposition to the Domeier permit. He stated that the hook that was stuck in Junior was harmful and permanent. He stated that shark jaws are very sensitive and he believes that the "throat-hooking" caused a ruptured, tumorous infection, which then weakened the animal and made it susceptible to attack and malnutrition. He said he would like to give a formal presentation to the staff, based on his 20 years of experience at Año Nuevo.

Callaghan Fritz, Pelagic Shark Research Foundation, said he's been working with Sean since 1996. He opposes the permit and believes the plight of individual sharks have gone unanswered or ignored. Landing an animal this size is unnecessary in order to track it. He sees Domeier's work as "science for TV".

Madeline Hope, Launch for Hire, is a property owner in Inverness Park. She and her husband inherited complicated files on their property. There are a lot of historic violations and they have been trying to keep the building in compliance while preventing it from falling into the Bay. The building is on the historic registry of the National Park Service, and they are waiting on direction from the California Coastal Commission, which is waiting on direction from GFNMS. We would like to know the results of the compliance report. She also added that she has been a recipient of a B-WET grant in the community and is sad the funding to B-WET has been cut.

Maria Brown stated that GFNMS will look into what information the Coastal Commission needs from the sanctuary.

Bob Wilson submitted written comments for the record.

BREAK

Vessel Spills Working Group (Pat Rutten and Irina Kogan)

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/spillresponse.pdf

The question was posed to the council: What would you like the Working Group to address? It was mentioned that the results of the use of dispersants in Deepwater Horizon should be considered. Jackie noted that the issue in BP was that the approval process for certain technologies might be preferred to dispersant. She would like a list of pre-approved technologies.



Pat Rutten mentioned that staging and readiness is a huge issue, Deepwater Horizon was offshore, and it caught people by surprise. Jaime is gathering data to build an ERMA for pre-spill planning, and there is talk of getting HF Radar put into this. NMFS is on the restoration and response side of the damage assessment. Peter Grenell mentioned the possibility of NOAA working with the harbor district to establish facilities and stockpiles at Pillar Pt. Harbor to reduce the response time if a spill occurred. Maria Brown said that there is a precedent for that in Bolinas Lagoon. The community has worked with the county, OSPR has bought boom, and the local fire department is trained to put the boom out.

Vessel Activities Working Group (Jackie Dragon and UCSB Bren Masters candidates, Sarah Green and Kate Labrum)

There was brief mention of changing the name of the working group because it didn't make sense.

Jackie gave a brief update on the working group. They are looking into data gaps for the region, and more group membership. Some questions they are still considering: Where are the whales? What types of ships are out there? What ships are involved in strikes? She clarified that the working group will be examining large commercial traffic, not whale watching boats and fishing boats. The shipping industry is involved, and they have asked that the working group re-examine the type of vessels they will focus upon.

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/brenwhales.pdf

As discussion commenced Sarah said they have had minimal response from the shipping industry, they had hoped to get more feedback, whether good or bad, and are wondering if there is an information barrier. Jackie asked what time and effort would be involved in applying the knowledge to our joint working group. Kate responded that it could be adapted and applied fairly quickly. Jessica Redfern is conducting a study that has great data and modeling capabilities. Sarah said it was a challenge to reconcile different data sources so they just used sanctuary data. Sarah and Jackie discussed how ships on the Great Circle Route have the option of adding a ship to make up time lost from reduced speed. Jan was interested in the cell size of Jessica Redfern's analysis, which Sarah thinks is 50km, dependent upon line density, a resolution that was found not insufficient in evaluating the channel, but useful for southern routes.

Oceans After School (Justin Holl):

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_05/oas.pdf

Discussion of next SAC meeting followed, important dates were mentioned.

June 21st is the new SAC member orientation, it is open for everyone to attend: 2-5PM.

October 6- SAC Retreat at Cal Academy of Sciences.

August 11th- next SAC meeting in Pacifica.

Meeting Adjourned at 4:35pm.